



INQUIRY FIELD GUIDE

*20+ PRACTICAL STRATEGIES AND
PROTOCOLS TO PROMPT QUESTIONS
AND FACILITATE INVESTIGATIONS*

Whole-Class Critique

The What

For beginners to critique, a whole-class format is recommended. The expectations for good critique language and mindset can be frequently reinforced while the teacher has total control of the protocol itself. Use this format if students are just beginning to learn about critique or struggling to demonstrate kind, helpful, and specific feedback behaviors with consistency.

The How

1. Before the critique, select a single Success Criterion from the project's rubric or checklist.
 - Choose a Criterion that students are on the brink of mastering, but will still be a challenge to identify and describe with fluency.
2. Set the stage for critique:
 - Review the meaning of the pre-selected Success Criterion.
 - Review the language expectations for critique, such as warm, cool, and suggestion feedback that is kind, helpful, and specific.
 - Warm feedback sentence stems:
 1. "I see you're meeting the goal of ____ because I see ____"
 2. "One example of something that's meeting your goal is ____"
 - Cool feedback sentence stems:
 1. "I don't think you've met the goal of ____ because I see ____"
 2. "One example of something that is not yet there is ____"
 - Suggestion feedback sentence stems:

1. "One way you could try to change _____ is by _____"
 2. I would suggest trying _____ because _____"
 3. "Could you try..."
 4. "What if you..."
3. Present a teacher-created model of the work to be critiqued that is intentionally imperfect in regard to the Success Criterion. (5 minutes)
 - Invite warm, cool, and suggestion feedback that follows structured sentence stems as much as possible.
 - Redirect students to focus only on the pre-selected Success Criterion, as needed.
 - Celebrate exemplars of kind, helpful, and specific critique comments without agreeing or disagreeing with the perspectives of those comments.
 - Reflect on the feedback received by thinking aloud about what was most helpful and what you would be inclined to change through revision of the work.
 4. Repeat the protocol with a student or group's work that could be considered average in regard to the pre-selected Success Criterion. (5 minutes)
 - Reinforce sentence stems, a focus on the Success Criterion, and thoughtfully crafted comments as much as possible without agreeing or disagreeing with the perspectives of any particular critique comment.
 - Invite the presenting student or group to think aloud about what feedback was most helpful and how they might revise as a result.
 5. Repeat the protocol with another student or group, as time permits.
 6. Debrief by asking students to reflect on what they were inspired to revisit in their own work based on what they heard in the whole-class critiques.
 - Emphasize that, even when you are not the receiver of critique directly, it's helpful to learn from others' critiques.

- It may be helpful for students to write down their next steps for revision while the critiques are fresh in their minds.
- Celebrate the poise and growth mindset of all presenters and the thoughtfulness of all critiquers.

Visit [inquired.org/fieldguide](https://www.inquired.org/fieldguide) for the following resource(s):

1. *Critique Sentence Stems* handout: These frames may support students as they practice forming kind, helpful, and specific critique comments.
2. *Critique Form* handout: This half-sheet supports students in writing down the most salient bits of warm, cool, and suggestion feedback for a presenter during critique.
3. *Critique Rules* posters: For ongoing reinforcement, these posters remind students of the expectations for good critique by displaying sentence stems and visual cues.
4. *Critique Hazards and Tips* guide: This comprehensive resource provides guidance for teacher practice around critique, including common obstacles and how to avoid them.